



BERKELEY WOMEN'S LAW JOURNAL

RECEIVED

AUG 09 1994

SCHOOL OF LAW LIBRARY
BERKELEY

Berkeley women's law journal
Treadwell

1993

Volume 8



BERKELEY WOMEN'S LAW JOURNAL

The *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* (ISSN 0882-4312) is edited by the students of Boalt Hall School of Law, University of California, Berkeley and published once a year by the University of California Press. All articles copyright © 1993 by the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* except when expressly indicated.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: Subscriptions are \$100/Sponsor, \$30-99/Friend, \$38/Institution, \$17/Regular, \$9/Student. The first two categories are tax deductible. Subscribers outside the U.S. should add \$4.00 for postage.

CORRESPONDENCE: Address all correspondence regarding subscriptions, address changes and claims for undelivered copies to Berkeley Women's Law Journal, University of California Press, 2120 Berkeley Way, Berkeley, CA 94720. Please allow at least four weeks for change of address to take effect. Address all business correspondence, including advertising orders and requests for permission to reproduce material from the *Journal* to Berkeley Women's Law Journal, University of California Press, 2120 Berkeley Way, Berkeley, CA 94720.

MANUSCRIPTS: We invite you to submit your original, unpublished work to the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal*. Please send a typed copy with wide margins. Submitted manuscripts cannot be returned unless the author so requests, and provides a self-addressed stamped envelope.

FORM: Citations generally follow *A Uniform System of Citation* (15th ed.) and *Webster's Standard American Style Manual* (1985). This issue should be cited as 8 BERKELEY WOMEN'S L.J. — (1993)



© 1993 Berkeley Women's Law Journal
University of California, Boalt Hall School of Law
Berkeley, California 94720

Published annually by the
University of California Press
Printed by Joe Christensen, Inc.

Designed by Kate Godfrey
Logo designed by June Beltran

The *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* is guided by an editorial policy which distinguishes us from other law reviews and feminist journals. Our mandate is to publish research, analysis, and commentary that address the lives and struggles of underrepresented women, such as women of color, poor women, lesbians, and disabled women. We believe that excellence in feminist legal scholarship requires critical examination of categories such as race, class, sexual orientation, and disability as well as gender. Therefore, discussions of "women's issues" that treat women as a monolithic group do not fall within our mandate. Articles may come within the mandate because of their subject matter, or because of their analytical attention to differences in social location among women. The truly broad scope of this mandate, and the diversity of scholarship it supports, is reflected in this volume of the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal*.

The majority of pieces submitted to this journal, however, do not fall within the mandate. There are far too few of us in legal education and practice committed to advocating for women, let alone focusing on those women least served by the legal system. Rather than abandon or modify our mandate in response to the limited pool of available scholarship, we hope to actively cultivate and support such scholarship by recommitting ourselves to the vision our mandate reflects. We need your help. This forum can only exist with the vigorous participation of thinkers and writers nationwide who share our vision and our commitment. We urge you, our readers and friends, to consider the issues raised in the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* as you pursue your own work. Share your work-in-progress with us. Publish with us. Tell your colleagues, students, and teachers about us. If you read an unpublished paper, or hear a speech at a conference, that addresses the mandate of the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal*, refer it to us. Join us in nurturing and critically engaging the legal research, theories, and strategies required to serve the interests of underrepresented women, and thus serve the interest we all share in social justice.

It was a party. 1992 was the Year of the Woman and we had many victories to celebrate. Internationally, we saw Rigoberta Menchú awarded the Nobel Peace Prize. Nationally, we put four more women into the Senate, for a total number of six women senators. We increased the number of women in Congress to forty-eight. We watched Clinton include many women in his cabinet and, in particular, we celebrated the appointment of the first woman Attorney General, Janet Reno, after a painful battle and an unfortunate withdrawal. We went to the polls and got an incredible woman in the White House (her husband isn't too bad either).

In California, we took particular pride in the election victories of two women—Barbara Boxer and Diane Feinstein—to the U.S. Senate. We smiled broadly when Roberta Achtenberg was nominated for the position of Assistant Secretary for Fair Housing and Equal Opportunity in the Department of Housing and Urban Development—making her the only openly identified lesbian appointed to a high ranking position in the cabinet.

And we all breathed a sigh of relief when Sharon Kowalski *finally* went home where she belonged.

Within the Boalt Hall community, we celebrated the awarding of tenure to two of Boalt's finest professors, Angela Harris and Andrea Peterson. We also watched Herma Hill Kay complete her first year as Dean.

But the party is far from over. Women deserve more than a year. We must all remain committed to engaging in the daily battle for gaining rights for *all* women. We must struggle to guarantee all women housing as hard as we struggled to get more women into the House.

The Journal is particularly proud of this volume, as it addresses the women whose victories we did not celebrate or whose hardships we did not see. All of the articles reflect the type of scholarship we want to promote: articles that move traditionally underrepresented women—lesbians, women of color, poor women and disabled women—from a marginalized position in legal discourse to the center of discussion. While we celebrate our achievements, The Berkeley Women's Law Journal firmly believes that *every* year is the Year of the Woman.

Dedication

The Journal would like to dedicate this issue to

AUDRE LORDE

1934-1992

Thank you for being a Burst of Light
in all of our lives
and for teaching us that
no Sister is an Outsider



BERKELEY WOMEN'S LAW JOURNAL

1993

Volume 8

TRIBUTE

Your Silence Will Not Protect You: A Tribute to Audre Lorde 1
Barbara Christian

COMMENTARY

Proposition 165: We Won the Battle, But Are We Losing the War? 6
Mariana Moore

ARTICLES

Jewish Women, Black Women: Guarding Against the Oppression of Surrogacy 29
Beverly Horsburgh

Feminist Legal Epistemology 63
Susan H. Williams

Color Me Queer: An Aesthetic Challenge to Feminist Essentialism 106
Maia Ettinger

Involuntary Sterilization of Mentally Disabled Women 122
Roberta Cepko

*It is the policy of the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* not to draw a distinction between student pieces and the work of scholars, practitioners, and community workers.

ESSAYS

- Thanking the Right Wing 166
Roberta Achtenberg
- Expanding the Definition of Family: A
Universal Issue 170
Maria Gil de Lamadrid
- The Right Forum on the Right Issue:
Initiatives and Family Values 180
Matt Coles
- RECENT PUBLICATIONS** 186

Board of Editors 1992-1993

Editor-in-Chief

Deirdre Davis

Executive Editors

KT Albiston
Elizabeth Pendo

Articles Editors

Maitreya Badami
Jacqueline Bendy
Roger Berkowitz
Cynthia Dailard
Erica Etelson
Alexa King
Kay Levine
Susan Lynx

Book Review Editor

Faye I. Chen

Managing Editor

Cynthia Dailard

Solicitations Editor

Alexa King

Subscriptions Editor

Jacqueline Bendy

Commentary Editor

Kaaryn Gustafson

Associate Editors

JJ Gass
Ingrid Mittermaier

Members

Ed Adams
Amber Alonso
Ellen Auriti
Allison Barr
Nicole Berner
Gretchen Bosschart
Sevilla Claydon
Bethany Dreyfus
Beth Eggers
Kate Fogle
Lori Grange
Stephanie Guitton
Tamara Lange
Jessica Lanning
Elizabeth Letcher
Matthew Levett

Michael Lewis
David Lowe
Janet Manrique
Laura Beth Nielsen
Laura Parsky
Annie Perry
Denise Pino
Ann Quirk
Rebecca Schleifer
Deedee Schroeder
Meena Sripathy
Katherine Stewart
Candace Tillman
George Turner
Michael von Loewenfeldt
Glenda Zarbock

National Advisory Board

Herma Hill Kay
Dean and Professor of Law
University of California, Berkeley
Faculty Advisor

Hon. Roberta Achtenberg
Member, Board of Supervisors
San Francisco

Lynn B. Cooper
Professor of Social Work
California State University, Sacramento

Hon. LaDoris H. Cordell
Judge
Superior Court, State of California

Constance de la Vega
Assistant Professor of Law
University of San Francisco

Anna de Leon
Private Attorney at Law
Berkeley

Mary C. Dunlap
Professor of Law
San Francisco

Carmen A. Estrada
Director of Affirmative Action
University of California

Margaret Fung
Executive Director
*Asian American Legal Defense and
Education Fund, New York*

Hon. Donna J. Hitchens
Judge
Superior Court, State of California

Arlie Hochschild
Professor of Sociology
University of California, Berkeley

Emma C. Jordan
Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center

Hesung Chun Koh
Chairperson and President
*East Rock Institute
New Haven*

Linda J. Krieger
Attorney at Law
Oakland

Judith E. Kurtz
Senior Staff Attorney
Equal Rights Advocates, San Francisco

Jean Love
Professor of Law
University of Iowa

Carrie Menkel-Meadow
Professor of Law
University of California, Los Angeles

Eva Paterson
Associate Director
*San Francisco Lawyers' Committee for
Urban Affairs*

Andrea L. Peterson
Acting Professor of Law
University of California, Berkeley

Deborah L. Rhode
Professor of Law
Stanford University

Marjorie M. Shultz
Professor of Law
University of California, Berkeley

Judith Stacey
Associate Professor of Sociology
University of California, Davis

Kathryn H. Tijerina
President
*Institute for American Indian Arts
Santa Fe, New Mexico*

Karen Tokarz
Professor of Law
Washington University, St. Louis

Hon. Diane E. Watson
State Senator
28th District, Los Angeles

D. Kelly Weisberg
Professor of Law
*Hastings College of the Law,
San Francisco*

Wendy Williams
Associate Dean for Research
Professor of Law
Georgetown University Law Center

Sponsors and Friends

Sponsors

| | |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Bonita L. Churney | Elizabeth Denny Mester |
| Prof. James A. Crawford | San Francisco Lawyers' |
| Frances M. Davis | Committee for Urban Affairs |
| Carmen A. Estrada | Marjorie M. Shultz |
| Furtado, Jaspovice & Simons | Eleanor Swift |
| Sue Hansen | Michael E. Tigar |
| Dean Herma Hill Kay | Bernard E. Witkin |

Friends

| | |
|-----------------------------|------------------------|
| Merri Baldwin | Prof. Joyce A. Hughes |
| Stephen Barnett | Deborah Johnson |
| Mary Becker | Grace C. Kennedy, Esq. |
| Eileen Blackwood | Ellen Leonard |
| Pat Cain and Jean C. Love | Rella Lossy |
| Martha Chamallas | Carrie Menkel-Meadow |
| Sophia Davidson | Rachel F. Moran |
| John and LaFredia Davis | Donna Peizer |
| Prof. Mary Dean | Prof. Andrea Peterson |
| Thiele R. Dunaway | Ruthann Robson |
| Elizabeth Kelly Ebitz, Esq. | Donna Miae Ryu |
| Jan Findlater | Ann Shalleck |
| Prof. Barbara Flagg | Reva Siegel |
| Deirdre D. Ford | Judith Stacey |
| Alissa Friedman | Leroy Walker |
| Lillian F. Hamrick | Frances E. Werner |